50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements

Edina Improvement No. P-23

Feasibility Study and Report

Prepared for:
City of Edina

January 21, 2014

January 21, 2014

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council
City of Edina
4801 West 50th Street
Edina, MN 55424

Attn: Bill Neuendorf
Economic Development Manager

Re: Feasibility Study and Report
50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements
Edina Improvement No. P-23
City of Edina, Minnesota

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council:

The enclosed feasibility report has been prepared for the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements, as authorized at the August 20, 2013 City Council meeting. The feasibility report identifies the elements of the proposed improvements developed with city staff and with input from business owners and property owners in the 50th & France District. the engineer's opinion of probable construction and design costs and a method for financing the project are also provided in the feasibility report.

Information used in the preparation of this report included previous studies, information gathered through field reviews of the project area, discussions with city staff, meetings with the property owners and business owners in the 50th & France District, and a 50th & France District customer survey.

We believe that the proposed project is feasible, that it will benefit the properties in the project area, and that it will benefit the City of Edina.

Sincerely,

KIMLEY-HORN AND ASSOCIATES, INC.

Daniel J. Coyle, P.E.
Project Manager

Enclosure
File: 160603003.3

FEASIBILITY STUDY AND REPORT

FOR

CITY OF EDINA

50th & FRANCE PARKING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVEMENTS

EDINA IMPROVEMENT NO. P-23

Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.
2550 University Avenue West
Suite 238N
St. Paul, MN 55114
(651) 645-4197

I hereby certify that this plan, specification or report was prepared by me or under my direct supervision and that I am duly Licensed Professional Engineer under the laws of the State of Minnesota.

Signature: _____
Daniel J. Coyle, P.E.

Date: January 21, 2014 Lic. No: 44821

CITY OF EDINA
50th & FRANCE DISTRICT
PARKING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVEMENTS
EDINA IMPROVEMENT NO. P-23

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CITY OF EDINA
50th & FRANCE DISTRICT
PARKING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVEMENTS
EDINA IMPROVEMENT NO. P-23

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Feasibility Study and Report has been prepared for the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements. The proposed project includes repair, rehabilitation and future expansion of parking, a new parking wayfinding system, and repair and rehabilitation of the landscape and streetscape elements.

The proposed scope of the improvements is generally as follows:

- Add 140 to 200 new parking stalls through a public / private partnership on the 3930 West 49 ½ Street property (formerly the Edina Realty building) and / or other sites in the 50th & France District. This goal will be pursued as a separate project.
- Perform essential parking ramp repairs and preventative maintenance to the parking ramps.
- Paint the interior of all parking ramps and the exterior of the South Ramp.
- Replace deteriorated pavers with more salt tolerant pavers and improve drainage system below pavers.
- Replace dying street trees and repair planter beds.
- Screen all garbage areas with enclosure walls (two at Middle Ramp and one at South Ramp) and implement recycling centers.
- New elevator and stair core in northeast corner of the South Ramp.
- Increase brightness of parking ramp lighting by replacing existing fixtures with motion sensing LED fixtures.
- Install a dynamic public parking wayfinding system.
- Install an automatic underground irrigation system to serve two planter areas on south side of Middle Ramp.
- Create easily identified pedestrian zones to and through parking ramps using floor paint, curbs and bollards.
- Enhanced operations and maintenance of the parking ramps including power washing all ramps once per year, improved sanitation and quarterly cleaning of all glass.
- Add hospitality signs at the entrance and exit of parking ramps.
- Designate approximately 230 additional employee parking stalls and monitor employee parking demand.
- Work with Metro Transit to add bus route and schedule signs, benches and bus shelters, and possibly real-time bus arrival information.

The estimated costs for the proposed improvements are summarized below. These costs include a 20 percent construction cost contingency and a 30 percent allowance for indirect costs such as engineering, administrative, and legal items as well as capitalized interest. Items in italics would be assessed under Chapter 429.

Proposed Capital Improvements		Estimated Cost
D.1	Increase Brightness of Lighting	$ 650,000
E.1	Parking Ramp Pedestrian Access	$ 100,000
E.3	New Elevator and Stair in South Ramp	$ 1,100,000
F.3	Dynamic Public Parking Wayfinding System	$ 350,000
G.1	*Paint All Ramp Interior and South Ramp Exterior Surfaces*	*$ 1,375,000*
G.6	*Screen All Garbage Areas*	*$ 60,000*
H.1	*Replace Dead / Dying Trees*	*$ 25,000*
H.2	*Replace Broken Pavers*	*$ 500,000*
H.13	Automatic Irrigation System	$ 175,000
H.14	*Repair Planter Beds*	*$ 50,000*
I.1	*Essential Ramp Repairs*	*$ 650,000*
I.2	*Preventative Ramp Maintenance*	*$ 650,000*
	Total Capital Cost	$ 5,685,000

Proposed Additional Annual Maintenance Improvements		Estimated Cost
B.3	*Holiday Season Parking Strategies*	*$ 35,000*
E.3	*New Elevator and Stair in South Ramp Maintenance*	*$ 10,000*
F.3	*Dynamic Public Parking Wayfinding System Maintenance*	*$ 10,000*
G.3	*Power Washing on Annual Basis*	*$ 30,000*
G.4	*Improve Sanitation*	*$ 10,000*
H.13	*Automatic Irrigation System Maintenance*	*$ 5,000*
I.2	Escrow for Future Periodic Preventative Maintenance	$ 100,000
Total Additional Annual Maintenance Cost		$ 200,000

The improvements are proposed to be financed through a combination of assessments, parking permit revenues, and other city funds. The following is a summary of the estimated funding amounts from each of the proposed financing sources:

Capital Cost Financing Source	Amount
Assessments	$ 3,310,000
Other City Funds	$ 2,375,000
Total	$ 5,685,000

Additional Annual Maintenance Cost Financing Source	Amount
Assessments	$ 100,000
Parking Permit Revenues	$ 100,000
Total	$ 200,000

Annual operations and maintenance costs have been in the range of $250,000 per year for the past few years. The Additional Annual Maintenance Cost of $200,000 is in addition to the historic average cost.

Rebates for installing energy efficient light may be available from Xcel Energy to offset a portion of the cost of the lights. The amount of rebates offered by Xcel varies from time to time and would be determined at the time of design and construction.

The following is a proposed schedule for the implementation of the improvements.

City Council Receive Feasibility Report, Call for Public Hearing, and Authorize Preparation of Final Plans and Specifications	January 21, 2014
Public Hearing, City Council Orders Project , Approves Plans and Specifications and Authorizes Ad for Bids	February 18, 2014
Bid Opening	May 22, 2014
Assessment Hearing / Award Contract	June 3, 2014
Edina Art Fair	*June 6-8, 2014*
Start 2014 Construction	June 16, 2014
Interim Construction Completion	October 2014
2014 Holiday Shopping Season	*Nov-Dec, 2014*
Start 2015 Construction	March 2015
Edina Art Fair	*June 2015*
Construction Complete	October 2015

The focus of construction in 2014 would be the dynamic wayfinding system, lighting upgrade, pedestrian access improvements, streetscape improvements, parking structure repairs and preventative maintenance. In order to mitigate impacts to businesses during construction, construction of the new stair and elevator core for the South Ramp and interior and exterior ramp painting is assumed to occur in 2015. The resulting project construction schedule will be longer than if all work is completed concurrently.

Based upon the analysis completed as a part of this report, the proposed 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements are feasible, necessary, and cost effective and would benefit the properties and businesses in the project area and the City of Edina.

1. INTRODUCTION

On August 20, 2013 the Edina City Council authorized the preparation of a feasibility study for the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvement project, Edina Improvement No. P-23. The proposed project includes repair, rehabilitation and future expansion of parking, a new parking wayfinding system, and repair and rehabilitation of the landscape and streetscape elements.

A feasibility report was previously prepared for 50th & France Parking Ramp Expansion in April 2012. The recommendations from that report were not implemented, due to business owner and property owner concern about project cost and impacts during construction. That feasibility report was based on the shared parking analysis dated April 12, 2011 that recommends adding 140 – 200 additional parking stalls.

Currently the following public parking is provided in the Edina portion of 50th & France District:

- South Ramp: 415 total spaces 200 employee spaces
- Middle Ramp: 274 total spaces 0 employee spaces
- North Ramp: 262 total spaces 220 employee spaces
- Clancy Lot: 36 total spaces 0 employee spaces
- Lunds Lot (Public): 15 total spaces 0 employee spaces
- On-Street: 20 customer spaces 0 employee spaces

There are an additional 305 private spaces in Edina owned by Lunds, Walgreens, BMO Harris Bank , US Bank, the post office, and the 5000 France condos.

Currently the following public parking is provided in the Minneapolis portion of the 50th & France District:

- Ewing Lot: 80 total spaces 0 employee spaces
- On-Street: 20 customer spaces 0 employee spaces

There are private lots that provide an additional 165 spaces in Minneapolis. A project location map is provided as Exhibit 1 in Appendix A with parking ramp locations shown on Exhibit 2 in Appendix A.

Subsequent to the April 2012 feasibility report, a group of Edina property owners presented a parking expansion concept to the city that would add structured parking to the east and west of the North Ramp. This concept addressed the business owner and property owner concern about project cost and impacts during construction. The property owner proposal required acquisition of the property to the east of the North Ramp (former Edina Realty building) and to the west of the North Ramp (former Hooten Cleaner building). As a result of this proposal, and other considerations, the city proceeded with this feasibility study.

This feasibility report has been developed with input from the 50th & France Business and Professional Association (the "Association") and their members. See Section 4 – Public Involvement for more information regarding stakeholder involvement. The following Guiding Principles were created to help the project development process:

In order to maintain and enhance the 50th & France district vision, to be the pre-eminent destination for the discerning consumer desiring a charming neighborhood experience, the following improvements should be made to the parking system and public areas that support the viability of the local businesses.

- *Provide **adequate number of parking stalls** to accommodate employees and customers*
- *Provide **clean, well maintained, safe, welcoming and accessible** parking structures*
- ***Optimize the use of existing parking** using appropriate parking management best practices*
- *Provide an effective communication system to **help customers navigate to available parking stalls***
- *Provide opportunities to **access the district via non-motorized means** such as Metro Transit, on foot and by bicycle*
- *Provide a streetscape that is well maintained, accessible, safe, and continues to **reinforce the unique character and identity of the district***
- *Have a **sustainable financing mechanism** for annual maintenance, periodic repairs and future replacement*
- ***Mitigate construction impacts to businesses during construction**, including no construction from October 23 through January 1 and during the Edina Art Fair.*

The proposed project recommended in this feasibility report is consistent with the Guiding Principles. The proposed scope is generally as follows:

- Add 140 to 200 new parking stalls through a public / private partnership on the 3930 West 49 ½ Street property (formerly the Edina Realty building) and / or other sites in the 50th & France District. This goal will be pursued as a separate project.

- Perform essential parking ramp repairs and preventative maintenance to the parking ramps.
- Paint the interior of all parking ramps and the exterior of the South Ramp.
- Replace deteriorated pavers with more salt tolerant pavers and improve drainage system below pavers.
- Replace dying street trees and repair planter beds.
- Screen all garbage areas with enclosure walls (two at Middle Ramp and one at South Ramp) and implement recycling centers.
- New elevator and stair core in northeast corner of the South Ramp.
- Increase brightness of parking ramp lighting by replacing existing fixtures with motion sensing LED fixtures.
- Install a dynamic public parking wayfinding system.
- Install an automatic underground irrigation system to serve two planter areas on south side of Middle Ramp.
- Create easily identified pedestrian zones to and through parking ramps using floor paint, curbs and bollards.
- Enhanced operations and maintenance of the parking ramps including power washing all ramps once per year, improved sanitation and quarterly cleaning of all glass.
- Add hospitality signs at the entrance and exit of parking ramps.
- Designate approximately 230 additional employee parking stalls and monitor employee parking demand.
- Work with Metro Transit to add bus route and schedule signs, benches and bus shelters, and possibly real-time bus arrival information.

The proposed improvements included as a part of this project are detailed in this report along with the estimated costs, a proposed financing plan, and a proposed schedule for the implementation of the project.

2. PROPOSED IMPROVEMENTS

The following is a summary of the proposed improvements included as a part of this project. Exhibits 3 through 6 in Appendix A further illustrate the proposed improvements.

A. Parking Expansion

With a goal of adding 140 to 200 new parking stalls within the district to better serve the needs of the community, the City of Edina has purchased the property at 3930 West 49 ½ Street, formerly the Edina Realty building. The city has investigated other possible expansion sites, including 3944 West 49 ½ Street (the Hooten Cleaners site) and the city's surface parking lot at Halifax and West 49 ½ Street (the Clancy Lot). At this time only the former Edina Realty building appears to be a candidate for parking expansion.

The preferred method for adding parking is to develop street level commercial space with new public parking provided above. In the future, the city may reach out to potential developers to formulate a redevelopment plan that is consistent with the vision of the 50th & France District and the goal to provide adequate public parking.

B. Customer Parking

No changes to customer parking. Customer parking will remain free.

C. Employee Parking

Designate approximately 230 additional permit parking stalls and continue to monitor employee parking demand. Designate the entire North Ramp, top two levels of the Middle Ramp, and the underground level of the South Ramp as employee permit parking. Leave all other parking as currently designated. The new employee permit areas should be designated as "5 HOUR AND PERMIT", similar to the existing employee permit areas. Peak employee parking demand is estimated to be as great as 750 stalls, but only 430 permit parking spaces are currently provided. These figures are for businesses in the Edina portion of the district only. The peak employee parking demand in the Minneapolis portion of the district is estimated to be 180 stalls.

50th & FRANCE PARKING SUMMARY CITY OF EDINA PARKING		
Ramp Name	**Existing Parking**	**Proposed Parking**
South Ramp	*415 Total Spaces*	*415 Total Spaces*
3rd Level	114 – Five Hour and Permit	114 – Five Hour and Permit
2nd Level	90 – Two Hour 20 – Five Hour and Permit	90 – Two Hour 20 – Five Hour and Permit
1st Level	110 – Two Hour	110 – Two Hour
Underground	80 – Permit Only	80 – Permit Only
Middle Ramp	*274 Total Spaces*	*274 Total Spaces*
3rd Level	94 – Five Hour	94 – Five Hour **and Permit**
2nd Level	90 – Five Hour	90 – Five Hour **and Permit**
1st Level	90 – Two Hour	90 – Two Hour
North Ramp	*262 Total Spaces*	*262 Total Spaces*
3rd Level	72 – Five Hour and Permit	72 – Five Hour and Permit
2nd Level	72 – Five Hour and Permit	72 – Five Hour and Permit
1st Level	72 – Five Hour and Permit	72 – Five Hour and Permit
Underground	45 – Two Hour	45 – **Five Hour and Permit**
Clancy Lot	*36 – One Hour (Some 15min)*	*36 – One Hour (Some 15min)*
France Ave On-Street	*20 – One Hour*	*20 – One Hour*
Lunds Lot (Public)	*15 – One Hour*	*15 – One Hour*
Other Private Parking	*305 – Varies*	*305 – Varies*
TOTALS	*305 – Private* *71 – One Hour* *335 – Two Hour* *184 – Five Hour* *350 – Five Hour and Permit* *80 – Permit Only*	*305 – Private* *71 – One Hour* *290 – Two Hour* *0 – Five Hour* *579 – Five Hour and Permit* *80 – Permit Only*

It is recommended that the employee parking permit price be increased from $60 per year to at least $120 per year. Ideally the employee parking permit price would be established to incentivize alternative modes of transportation and to fund an escrow account for future periodic ramp preventative maintenance. There are approximately 1,000 employees in the Edina portion of the district. In 2013 the city issued approximately 620 parking permits. It is assumed that not all employees are obtaining parking permits.

Work with Metro Transit to understand opportunities to make transit use simpler, including adding bus route and schedule signs, benches and bus shelters, and possibly real-time bus arrival information.

D. Parking Ramp Lighting and Security

Increase brightness in the parking ramps by replacing existing lights with motion sensing LED fixtures. It is assumed that the existing conduit and wiring can be reused.

In general, the existing lights are installed in pairs in each bay of the parking ramps. New fixtures would be selected that improve the light distribution and brightness using a one for one replacement. In the lowest level of the South Ramp, more fluorescent light fixtures are located in the center and west bays than the other bays in the parking ramp. Therefore, few replacement LED fixtures would be required in these two bays than currently exist.

E. Parking Ramp Pedestrian Access

Provide easily identifiable pedestrian walkways to and through the parking ramps using floor paint, curbs and / or bollards. Primary locations for walkways are in the ground level of all three parking ramps, and especially along the north side of the South Ramp where the Lunds sidewalk enters the South Ramp and crosswalks in the South Ramp at the two stairwells.

Construct a new elevator and replacement stair core in the northeast corner of the South Ramp. The new stair/elevator core would replace the existing stair which is in fair to poor condition. The addition of the elevator will make the parking ramp easier to navigate for patrons with physical disabilities, stroller or heavy packages.

F. Parking Wayfinding

Install a dynamic public parking directional signage system throughout the district with real time parking availability. The system will consist of four decorative signs with electronic directional information, one for each of the four major approaches to the district. These decorative signs will display directional arrows next to each ramp names, to indicate the direction to turn to navigate to a ramp, or the word “FULL” indicating the driver should plan to navigate to an alternate parking ramp. Each parking ramp will have a ground mounted decorative sign with electronic message board, with a special message for patrons entering ramp. Eight decorative non-electronic parking wayfinding signs with ramp name and directional arrow will be installed. See Exhibit 3 in Appendix A for proposed sign layout.

The parking wayfinding system will have a central server that receives input from vehicle sensing traffic counters at the entrance and exit from each of the three parking ramps to determine the number of available parking stalls in each parking ramp. This information will be used to determine if any of the three ramps are nearing capacity. If any of the ramps are nearing capacity, the decorative electronic parking wayfinding signs that are located at each major roadway approach to the 50th & France District will indicate "FULL" for that ramp so that drivers can navigate to one of the other ramps that has parking availability. The system is not intended to help drivers once they are in the ramp, given the relatively simple circulation pattern and driver search methods for finding available stalls in each ramp.

During final design the parking ramps and surface lots should be given formal names for use in the wayfinding system. Public art or internal paint schemes should be considered to reinforce the parking and pedestrian wayfinding system.

G. Parking Ramp Aesthetics

Paint all interior surfaces of all ramps, exterior of the South Ramp, and trash enclosures. Proper surface cleaning is critical prior to paint application. Surface preparing will include power washing or an equivalent cleaning method. Paint colors in stairwell and elevator lobbies and the first 30 feet of vehicle entry areas should be selected to reinforce the parking ramp identity and parking level to aid in pedestrian wayfinding.

- Paint underside of concrete decks including beams and slabs
- Paint concrete columns
- Paint interior of stairwells including metal stairs, railings and walls
- Paint walls in parking ramps
- Paint deck drains

Power wash parking ramps, including stairwells, on an annual basis. In addition to helping the ramps look clean, power washing will remove salts and dirt from the surface of the parking decks which will help extend the useful life of the parking ramps.

Improve sanitation of the ramps by picking up trash in stairwells on a weekly basis.

Install additional hospitality signs in the parking ramps, to enhance and compliment the signs installed in 2013.

Screen all garbage areas with enclosure walls; two enclosure walls for the Middle Ramp, and one enclosure wall for the South Ramp. Enclosure walls will be prefabricated ABS plastic or steel panel systems with painted steel posts, gates, hardware, to look like louvers, brick or wood slats and can be a custom color. Add recycling and composting centers in the existing garbage areas, provided there is room and can be screened.

H. Streetscape

Replace approximately a third of the existing sidewalk paver areas, which have deteriorated and have a high priority need of replacement. See Exhibit 4 in Appendix A. Provide concrete under slab drainage for all areas where concrete pavers are replaced.

Replace approximately 15% of the existing street trees. Adjust the tree grates of most of the street trees by cutting the openings larger and reset them to reduce tripping hazards.

Replace all of the trees and all of the shrubs and perennials in the at-grade and raised planting beds, due to poor health or outgrowing the planting area. Provide new planting design that includes a combination of shrubs and perennial plantings, for increased seasonal color and interest.

Remove the existing cast-in-place concrete sidewalk and plantings along the north wall of the Middle Ramp, and install concrete pavers on a permeable concrete under slab. Because of limited space between the existing curb and north face of the Middle Ramp install trash receptacle and bollards, but no plantings.

Install an automatic underground irrigation system to the landscape areas south of the Middle Ramp. Directional bore under sidewalks and driveways to access irrigated areas with electric valve wires and water supply piping. It is assumed that the existing irrigation service point, controller and water supply are adequate to serve the expanded irrigated area.

I. Parking Ramp Repairs

The project will provide for the essential repairs and preventative maintenance to the three parking ramps. Limits of repairs will be based on field observations and conditions.

Structural repairs will be performed to address corrosion and deterioration that has occurred to the structure and restore the integrity of the structures. In addition to the concrete structure, other systems in the structures such as plumbing, (i.e. drains and drain piping) will be repaired. These repairs include the following:

- Caulk joint replacement
- Failed shear tab replacement (Middle Ramp only)
- Expansion joint replacement
- Concrete crack sealing
- Concrete repairs
- Drain and corroded piping replacements
- Railing repairs
- Deck sealer on concrete decks
- Traffic membrane on concrete deck
- Replace caulk joints in precast panels
- Painting of structural steel
- Replace guardrail

J. Maintenance

Ongoing maintenance will be important to maintain the investment in the parking ramps at 50th & France and also provide an inviting appearance for the customers. By performing timely repairs and maintenance of the ramps, the useful life of the structures should be realized or exceeded. With timely maintenance, the anticipated useful life of the Middle Ramp should be an additional 20 years, the South Ramp should be over 30 years (except possibly the joist system above the lowest level), and the North Ramp should be over 40 years. With the repairs being performed in 2014, a better assessment of the condition of the reinforcing steel in that portion of the structure can be made which will allow a more accurate assessment of the useful life of that portion of the structure to be made.

The following is a list of items and suggested frequency of activities:

Daily/Weekly

- Debris collection
- Sweeping of stairwells
- Washing windows in stair and elevator cores

Monthly

- Sweeping of decks

Annually

- Power washing of decks
- Inspection of decks/identification of restoration needs
- Re-lamp burned out lights*

  * Frequency will depend on type of fixture. If existing fixtures are not replaced, it is recommended to relamp entire areas every two to three years and relamp outages on an annual basis. If LED fixtures are installed, replace lights on an as needed basis. LED lights should have a minimum life of ten years prior to needing replacement.

Periodically

- Repair deteriorated concrete (as needed)
- Seal cracks in concrete (as needed)
- Replace expansion joints (7 to 10 years)
- Replace caulk joints (7 to 10 years)
- Re-apply deck sealer (10 to 15 years)
- Re-apply traffic membrane (7 to 10 years)
- Repaint concrete surfaces (as needed)
- Repaint non-pedestrian steel railings (15 to 20 years)
- Repaint steel pedestrian railings (3 to 5 years)

Many of the more expensive maintenance activities occur infrequently, and need to be budgeted for to maintain a reserve fund to easily pay for these repairs. It is recommended that employee permit parking fees be increased so that $100,000 can be kept in reserve each year for future periodic preventative maintenance.

3. CONSTRUCTION PHASING/STAGING

Significant concern has been expressed by area property owners and business owners regarding the impact that the proposed construction could have on the ability for businesses to remain open and successful while construction is underway. Based on these concerns, we have considered options to minimize business impacts during construction.

It is proposed that construction be performed while the roadways and parking ramps are open to traffic, generally taking no more than 50 parking stalls out of service at any one time during daytime hours. Some repair activities would benefit from taking a larger area out of service at a time, such as deck sealing the entire upper level of the South Ramp. As an option to performing this work in two or three phases, doing it in one phase would require the area to be closed for two days. In these cases, the options would be discussed with the business and property owners to develop a plan acceptable to them. Some short duration activities will require taking more than 50 parking stalls out of service at one time, during nighttime hours.

It is proposed that streetscape work be completed in segments to limit construction disruption at the business storefronts. Other construction activities not resulting in significant parking or storefront access disruptions would be ongoing throughout the duration of the project.

The project will include special signage for wayfinding during construction. Wayfinding during construction is complicated by drivers and pedestrians attention to construction activity. Special construction signage will be installed, and adjusted for each phase of construction, to draw special attention to access routes to parking ramps, businesses and other points of interest.

Construction will be coordinated with the annual Edina events, the Edina Art Fair and the holiday shopping season, from the last week in October through the end of December.

Successful construction staging and phasing will require frequent communication with the business owners and the customers in the 50th & France district to clearly communicate the upcoming work and directing them to available parking spaces.

4. PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT

The City of Edina directed Kimley-Horn to conduct meetings with property owners and business owners in the 50th & France District to present information about the project and to give stakeholders an opportunity to provide input on the project. A small group of property owners and business owners was selected to provide input on the project process and decisions. This Project Advisory Team met seven times during the project and was critical in developing the Guiding Principles, alternatives and financing plan. An Open House meeting was held on September 18, 2013 to raise awareness of the project and to kick-off the public involvement activities. Nine focus group meetings with business owners and property owners were conducted between October 14 and October 18, 2013. The focus group meetings introduced a parking improvement survey that was available for business owners and property

owners to take on-line. A summary of these meetings and parking improvement survey can be found in Appendix C. A customer parking survey was conducted between December 14 and December 19, 2013. The results of the customer survey can be found in Appendix C. Kimley-Horn also requested employee work schedule information from all businesses to determine the employee parking demand during the week.

Many attempts were made to contact all property owners and business owners in the 50th & France District. A Kimley-Horn representative visited each business in the district over a two-day period to make initial contact and distribute an invitation to focus group meetings. Kimley-Horn and the Association sent periodic email messages to all business owners to reinforce the need for public participation in the project development process, and asked for specific involvement in the surveys. Continued public involvement will be key during the final design process.

5. ALTERNATIVES ANALYSIS

Based on the Guiding Principles the following alternatives were developed by city staff and the Project Advisory Team. Through focus group meetings and an on-line survey, business owners and property owners ranked the alternatives. See Appendix C for the results of the business owner and property owner survey. The alternatives are grouped by category below and listed in order of business owner and property owner preference, from higher to lower preference. Alternatives in **bold** are recommended and part of the proposed improvements. All order of magnitude costs include indirect costs and a contingency. The alternatives below are taken from the Menu of Alternatives matrix found in Appendix C. The Menu of Alternatives, in Appendix C, includes information about the Project Advisory Team's preferences about which alternatives should be included in the preferred alternative.

A. Parking Ramp Expansion

A.1 Add parking on Edina Realty and Hooten Cleaner sites with commercial space at ground level. Does not include demolition or cleanup of sites. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $12,000,000.

A.2 Add surface parking on Edina Realty and Hooten Cleaner sites with possible parking ramp construction in the future. Does not include demolition or cleanup of sites. Does not include future parking ramp costs. Assumes about 20 stalls on Hooten Cleaner site and 30 stalls on Edina Realty site. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $350,000.

A.3 Add parking ramp on Edina Realty, Hooten Cleaner and Clancy Lot sites with commercial space at ground level Does not include demolition or cleanup of sites. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $16,000,000.

A.4 Add parking ramp on new sites without integrated commercial space on ground level. Does not include demolition or cleanup of sites; 3 level expansion on Hooten Cleaners and Edina Realty sites. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $5,000,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

North Ramp Expansion Considerations

The expansion in each direction would allow for up to a three story expansion with the floor plates matching the elevations of the existing structure. Existing vehicle circulation within the ramps would be utilized to access the new floor plates. Pedestrian circulation for the west expansion of the existing ramp would utilize the existing stairs and elevator in the southwest corner. An additional stair would be required within the east expansion of the existing ramp to provide additional pedestrian exiting. Expansions would be constructed out of reinforced, post-tensioned concrete matching the existing ramp. Exterior materials would match the exterior of the existing North Ramp.

The North Ramp was originally constructed as a two level structure in 1991. A third level was added to the structure and also expanded to the west in the 1990's. Zoning requirements for the PCD-2 district allow height up to 48 feet or four stories through a height overlay district. However, expansion of the structure taller than three stories would likely require modifications to the foundations of the existing North Ramp. Setback requirements within the PCD-2 district require expansion to be set back twenty-five feet from the north property boundary that abuts a residential district unless a variance is attained. Expansion onto the former Edina Realty Building site matching parameters of the existing ramp was considered for this study and would require a variance. Expansion onto the Hooten Cleaners site matching the existing ramp parameters was considered for this study and would not require a variance.

Integrated Commercial / Parking Considerations

Considering the overall district, there is an expressed desire to consider the incorporation of commercial/retail space into the ground level of parking structure expansion. This mixed-use arrangement would provide additional commercial property frontage on 49 ½ Street and would minimize the impression of all parking along 49th ½ Street. The extent of commercial space considered in this study totaled 4,850 square feet on the Hooten Cleaners site and 7,500 square feet within the Edina Realty Building site. Creation of occupied spaces within the open air parking ramp requires waterproofing and insulation above the commercial space as well as fire separations, sprinklers and additional mechanical systems. In order to maximize new parking stalls, commercial space for this study was configured on the ground level only, underneath level two of the parking structures. This arrangement creates atypical commercial space requiring a sunken floor to achieve nine foot clear ceiling heights. When floors are sunk two to three feet below street level, ramps are required to create access for service and pedestrians. A more optimal configuration for retail spaces would require omitting level two in the parking structure expansion to allow clear ceiling heights approaching 15 feet.

Based on conversations with property owners in the 50th and France district, the commercial spaces, as described above, in parking ramps are not very desirable and could likely be leased in the $15 to $20 per square foot range. Assuming a 6 percent interest rate for the capital, the lease payments would not cover the financing cost for the commercial space.

Surface Parking Considerations

Another alternative considered is the construction of surface parking lots on either or both of the Edina Realty and Hooten Cleaners sites. This alternative would provide additional parking in the district and would provide time for the impact of parking management strategies and dynamic wayfinding to be evaluated.

Construction of the surface lots would also provide more parking spaces during construction activities to replace spaces lost due the construction work in the parking ramps.

B. Customer Parking

B.1 Free customer parking. No capital cost associated with this option.

B.2 Encourage turnover at prime customer spaces using posted time limits and / or meters. Assume meters for Edina on-street parking (40 stalls) and only signs in the ramps. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $25,000.

B.3 Holiday season parking strategies; additional parking ambassadors and offsite employee parking. Add two ambassadors from Nov 1 through January 15 from 7:30am - 7:30pm; Offsite employee parking on weekdays only during shopping season; Employees use 125 US Bank stalls during weekends during holidays. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $35,000 annually.

B.4 Add short term parking for customers or deliveries on south side of 49 1/2 Street. Add signs and pavement markings; Does not include street, sidewalk or curb work. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $10,000.

B.5 Add short term parking on north side of 51st Street. Add signs and pavement markings; Does not include street, sidewalk or curb work. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $10,000.

B.6 Valet parking. Four valet stations; Operates year round 10am - 10pm; Assume valet parking in ramps, except during holiday season. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $250,000 annually.

B.7 Access control and paid parking in South and Middle Ramps with 2 or 3 hour free parking. Validation program for additional time at business expense. Employee parking controlled by prox card and gates. No "ticket spitters" or controls for customer parking. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

B.8 Add meters to on-street parking both in Edina and Minneapolis. Assume 40 on-street stalls in Edina and 40 on-street stalls in Minneapolis. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Paid Parking Considerations
Customer parking is essential to the 50th & France District, although there are small numbers of customers that travel by transit, walk, bike or take other modes of transportation that do not require a parking stall. Parking for customers is almost always available, even during the holiday shopping season, but not always in locations convenient to customers' ultimate destination. The primary cause for customer parking inconvenience is attributed to employees parking in customer parking areas.

To improve the customer parking experience, employee compliance with permit parking regulations is essential. The following two parking strategies would be very effective to help customers and employees find appropriate parking:

- Access control and paid parking in the parking ramps with 2-3 hour free parking. Validation program for longer customer parking durations at businesses expense (Alternative B7).
- Add parking meters to on-street parking on France Avenue (Alternative B8).

Through the public involvement process, see Section 4, the business owners and property owners insisted that customer parking needs to be free, and no systems should be installed that might indicate paid customer parking. Both of the alternatives listed ranked at the bottom of customer parking strategies. With a free parking approach, the requirement to enforce compliance with the parking regulations becomes very important.

If enforcement of parking regulations is not effective in keeping customer stalls open, it is recommended that on-street meters and parking ramp access control be implemented. These are parking management best practices for parking environments like 50th & France.

C. Employee Parking

C.1 Leave employee parking as is: Top two levels of North Ramp, bottom and top level of South Ramp. No cost if parking is left as is.

C.2 Require all employees to have a parking permit. No infrastructure cost, only enterprise cost.

C.3 Employee parking in North Ramp, top of Middle Ramp and bottom level of South Ramp. Add signs and pavement markings. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $10,000.

C.4 Add lightweight roof over top level of parking ramps to add covered employee parking. Standing seam metal roof over entire ramp footprint. Does not include structural modifications to existing structures. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $6,700,000.

C.5 Dedicated motorcycle and bicycle parking area in all ramps. Add signs and pavement markings. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $15,000.

C.6 Install heated bus shelters along 50th & France with real-time "Next Bus In X Minutes" signage. Assumes four 4' x 10' shelters. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $500,000.

C.7 Graduated employee parking rates: Free in North Ramp, moderate fee for Middle Ramp, largest fee for South Ramp. Assumes no additional cost.

C.8 Incentivize public transit use by free bus passes and optimizing bus routes with MTC.

C.9 Add bike lockers and shower room to encourage bike commuting. 10 pairs of lockers per ramp - shower facility is included as tenant build out in 2,000 SF north ramp new commercial space - 2 ADA showers, 2 ADA toilets, plus retail for coffee or other limited food. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $700,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Lightweight Roof Considerations

New lightweight or fabric roofs on top of the existing North, Middle and South Ramps as a method of increasing use of the top levels by Employees was evaluated for this report. Roof materials of coated vinyl similar to the well-known Metrodome roof but supported by a steel structural framework fall into this category. For an addition of this type, one must first consider the building code and impacts on the structure.

Existing ramps are cast in place or precast concrete design of Type I or Type II construction. It is assumed that new structural members within a roof system would need to be fire rated to comply with the building code. For steel members, this would likely mean spray or trowel applied fire proofing that is visible within the ramp. Another consideration is natural ventilation. Open area on the sides of the ramps would need to be maintained if a roof structure was added to provide natural ventilation for the upper level of the ramp. This open area would need to be evenly distributed on all sides of the ramps. Roof structure and enclosure would need to account for this open area where structure meets the existing sidewall/parapet of the ramp. However, it may be possible that roof structural elements may not require fire rating if the roof is below the 50,000 square-foot area-per-tier limit for Type II-B construction per IBC 2006 table 406.3.5 and natural ventilation is provided.

In addition to building code, the zoning code must be considered. All existing ramps are within or surrounded by a zoning district that allows building height up to forty-eight feet. Current ramps adjacent to residential districts do not reach the forty-eight foot height. With the addition of roof structures on top of the existing upper levels of all ramps, it is possible that allowable building height may be met or exceeded. It is possible that adjacent property owners within residential districts could object to the additional height. Lightweight roofs would likely use fabric that is light in color – perhaps white. This color is typically chosen to allow daylight through the fabric to

supplement artificial light and to limit heat gain. The light color of lightweight roof structures could be received negatively by adjacent neighbors during the day. Lightweight roofs constructed of light or white colored fabrics will also glow when lighted at night. This condition not addressed in the zoning code but one that may need consideration in the same manner as lighting trespass.

Beyond zoning, operations and maintenance of additions to the existing ramps warrants consideration. Material used for lightweight roofs of fabric or other membrane roofs will require a level of maintenance exceeding current ramp roof maintenance. Lightweight roofs will likely channel water to locations on the ramp not currently provided with storm drains and additional drains and plumbing may be required. A lightweight roof, while possibly translucent and capable of transmitting some daylight, will require additional artificial lighting on the upper level.

Another strategy considered to provide protected employee parking on the top levels of all ramps is an open framework supporting a photovoltaic (solar) energy system. This type of system would provide some sun shading and weather projection for vehicles but would not completely block rain or snow. The system would likely be delivered in a turnkey fashion by a company that builds and operates the system and then sells energy to the Owner.

Given the relatively small size of Edina Ramps, a solar energy system project delivered and maintained by a third party would have a higher than average initial cost. Costs for renewable energy systems can be offset by state or federal grants and utility company incentives or credits.

D. Parking Ramp Lighting and Security

D.1 Increase brightness of lighting. One for one replacement of fixtures with motion sensing LED. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $650,000.

D.2 Add video surveillance in critical areas of all ramps. License plate readers and stairwell cameras. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $300,000.

D.3 Install "panic" stations with direct communication to police department. Two emergency phones per level of ramp totaling 20. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

D.4 Add video surveillance in all areas of all ramps. Full camera coverage in all ramps including license plate readers. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $750,000.

D.5 Hire a parking ambassador. Add ambassador from 7:30am - 7:30pm. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $60,000 annual cost.

D.6 Add video cameras in smaller alleyways and sidewalks. Add cameras to street lights, parking ramps or other public structures; Assumes conduit and wires for power and data are installed as part of sidewalk reconstruction for landscape / streetscape projects; Surface restoration costs need to be accounted for elsewhere; Assumes 20 cameras. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $300,000.

D.7 Increase foot patrols (police, ambassadors and / or night escorts). Add one part-time night escort for entire year. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

D.8 Replace functional lighting with decorative or indirect lighting. One for one replacement of fixtures except first level of South Ramp which would reduce the number of fixtures. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $400,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Lighting System Considerations

Two different light types are used in the parking ramps. The western two bays of the ground level of the South Ramp systems are fluorescent lights. The remainder of the lights in the South Ramp and all lights in the Middle Ramp and the North Ramp are metal halide lights.

To increase the level of lighting in the ramps, several different alternatives can be considered. A couple of these alternatives are:

- Add additional fixtures of the same type, i.e. metal halide or fluorescent lights
- Replace existing fixtures with a different that provides a higher level of light and a different light distribution to provide better light coverage

A lighting on demand system can also be installed to reduce energy usage. This type of system incorporates sensors for pedestrians and vehicles that turns on lights when a person or vehicle is approaching. After a period of time with no activity, the lights automatically turn off. One of the drawbacks to this system is that the parking ramps would appear dark or under-lit to a person entering the ramp or driving by. This could provide a sense of the ramp not being a safe place. If this system is used, some lights should be left on at all times to provide a minimum level of lighting.

Security System Considerations

Security features in parking ramps, in addition to good lighting and an open parking structure, can include security cameras, call for assistance buttons (panic buttons), license plate readers. Active measures, like security cameras, can be mounted throughout the parking ramps or just in more pedestrian heavy areas such as the stair wells and stair/elevator cores. The stair/elevator areas are critical areas where pedestrians want and need to feel safe. Most of the stairwells and elevator lobbies in the three parking ramps are fairly open and visible. Except for the southeast or center stair and the northwest stairs in the South Ramp, the stairs and elevators have adequate glass to provide visibility.

Security measures in these areas include having security cameras, call for assistance buttons and adequate lighting. Security cameras can provide live feeds to a security monitoring office or they can function as recording devices. Security cameras that are monitored require full time staff which significantly increases the operational cost. Security cameras used to record activities in the structures in case an incident is reported provides a means to investigate the incident.

Call for assistance buttons are connected to a security monitor office, which would likely be the Edina Police Department. When activated by a user, an officer would be dispatched to the location of the alert for assistance.

From an overall ramp security system, the additional security cameras can be installed to monitor more areas. Additionally, license plate readers can be installed at the entrance and exit points to record license plates on cars using the ramps. This would provide information on who was using the ramp in the event of a reported incident. In addition to this security purpose, the devices could be part of the system to collect data for monitoring employee parking and the dynamic wayfinding system.

E. Parking Ramp Pedestrian Access

E.1 Easily identified pedestrian zone to and through parking ramps using floor paint, curbs and bollards. Assumes four locations. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $100,000.

E.2 New elevator / stair in Middle Ramp. Assumed on south side of ramp located at midpoint in east-west direction. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $925,000.

E.3 New elevator / stair in South Ramp. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $1,100,000.

E.4 Designate more accessible parking stalls on first level of all parking ramps. Additional signs and pavement markings. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $10,000.

E.5 High visibility crosswalk/lighting at SE stair exit at South Ramp. Assumed 2 lighted signs and striping. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $15,000.

E.6 Add speed bumps or tables near pedestrian routes. Assumes removal of concrete and buildup of speed bump. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $75,000.

E.7 Reconstruct southeast stairwell in South Ramp to be compliant with current building code. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $450,000.

E.8 Skyway to connect Middle and North ramp buildings. Assumes skywalk supported independent of existing structures. Unheated space. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $1,350,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Elevator Considerations

At the present time, only the North Ramp has an elevator to provide handicap accessibility. Considering the mix of customers in the 50th and France district, improving the handicap accessibility in the South Ramp and the Middle Ramp is desirable.

Based on the size of the ramps, the addition of one elevator in each of the South Ramp and the Middle Ramp will meet the accessibility requirements of the current

building code. However, the current building code doesn't require that elevators need to be retrofit into the existing ramps. Elevator cabs would be sized to accommodate a wheeled stretcher or gurney.

South Ramp New Elevator / Stair in Northeast Corner

In the South Ramp, the recommended location of the elevator is in the northeast corner of the ramp. Given the condition of the existing stair in this location, the existing stair would be removed and a new stair and elevator core would be constructed in this location. The stair and elevator tower would serve each level of the parking ramp and provide access to the pedestrian walkways to France Avenue and 50th Street. With the stair/elevator located in the area of the existing northeast stair, it would provide an accessible route to the stair/elevator for the center and west bays of the ramp. With the grade of the east bay being steeper than 5 percent, an accessible route would not be provided for this area. Therefore, the accessible parking stalls on Levels 2, 3 and 4 should be located close to the stair/elevator core but in the center bay of the parking ramp.

Primary enclosure for the new elevator stair would be with glass walls to provide daylight, passive security and wayfinding.

The recommended location is in close proximity to surrounding buildings and the new structure would abut buildings to the east and west in addition to the ramp itself, adding some complexity and cost to the construction process.

Middle Ramp New Elevator / Stair Considerations

In the Middle Ramp, the recommended location of a new stair and elevator core is on the south side of the ramp. The new stair and elevator tower would be located outside the existing ramp footprint within the existing plaza and planting area. This location is considered optimal due to its adjacency to pedestrian routes behind existing 50th Street businesses and a pedestrian access leading from the Middle Ramp to 50th Street and the mid-block pedestrian crosswalk.

The new stair and elevator tower would serve all levels of the ramp and provide an accessible route from all bays of the ramp when accessible stalls are located in the flat, cross-over portions of the floor plate.

The new stair and elevator tower design would have extensive areas of glass to provide daylight, passive security and wayfinding for ramp users. Masonry cladding compatible with the adjacent commercial building context would be used on opaque wall areas.

Although a new elevator and stair for the Middle Ramp is desired by the property owners and business owners, the city does not currently have funds to construct this improvement. The decision not to fund this improvement as a part of this feasibility report is based primarily on the fact that the Middle Ramp has the shortest remaining service life of all of the ramps, and the availability of an elevator in the adjacent North Ramp.

Existing South Ramp Stair Core in Southeast Corner

The southeast stair core does not provide any visibility into the ramp for users. Additionally, the stair treads are about two inches shallower than the current code requirements (9 inch tread depth instead of 11 inch tread depth). Some of the stair pans are in fair to poor condition and are in need of replacement or strengthening. This stair well could be reconstructed to meet the current building code requirements, address structural deficiencies in the stairs and also provide glass areas to improve the visibility of the stairwell. This would require the removal and reconstruction of the west wall of the stairwell. If this option is pursued, structural analysis of the stair core would be required.

F. Wayfinding System

F.1 Static public parking directional signage throughout the district. Twelve (12) decorative non-electronic parking wayfinding signs with ramp name and directional arrow. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $25,000.

F.2 Static pedestrian directional signing to businesses and public ramps. Twenty-four (24) decorative non-electronic pedestrian wayfinding signs with "pedestrian street," "pedestrian plaza" and ramp names and directional arrows. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

F.3 Dynamic public parking directional signage throughout the district with real time parking availability. Four decorative electronic parking wayfinding signs with real-time parking availability, one for each major approach roadway; three decorative signs, one at each ramp, with special message for patrons entering ramp; eight decorative non-electronic parking wayfinding signs with ramp name and directional arrow. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $350,000.

F.4 Electronic pedestrian directional signing to businesses and public ramps. Eight decorative electronic interactive pedestrian wayfinding kiosks; 16 non-electronic pedestrian wayfinding signs with "pedestrian street," "pedestrian plaza" and ramp names and directional arrows. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $200,000.

F.5 Create public parking and pedestrian navigation smartphone app. Full service e-commerce parking website to purchase permits, get real-time parking availability, pay fines, etc...; Smartphone app with turn-by-turn directions to parking ramp; Smartphone app to mark parking location to aid pedestrian wayfinding back to vehicle. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $250,000.

F.6 District ambassadors direct drivers to available parking. No additional cost; Ambassador costs covered under other line items.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

District Ambassador Considerations

The 50th & France Association has considered hiring a district ambassador to increase employee parking compliance. A district ambassador would be a personable,

energetic person focused on the customer experience. Duties would include parking enforcement, providing directions to shops, identifying operations and maintenance needs, and promoting a safe and enjoyable customer experience. The Association met with two companies that provide district ambassador services to understand how to implement an ambassador program. It is not clear at this time whether an ambassador program will be implemented. In the meantime, the city will continue to have one full-time public works staff member assigned to the 50th & France district to address day-to-day maintenance issues and will add a community service officer to provide parking enforcement.

Parking Wayfinding Technology

There are many technology options for how a parking wayfinding system is implemented. There are a variety of solutions for how to count vehicles in the ramps and how to communicate parking availability information to users. There are systems that have real-time vehicle detectors in each parking stall, with an associated overhead light indicating an available space; green for available, red for occupied. This type of wayfinding system is most beneficial for very large parking ramps that have hundreds of stalls and multiple circulation routes per level. These higher end systems are also best suited for installation with new construction. The one-way vehicle circulation pattern in each of the 50th & France parking ramps forces drivers to pass every stall on each parking ramp level, making real-time presence detectors less beneficial. Given the relatively large installation cost for real-time presence detectors, and the fact that the wayfinding system is being retrofit into the existing parking ramps, it is proposed that parking ramp capacity / availability information be computed from a simple counter at the entrance and exit points to the ramps.

G. Parking Ramp Aesthetics

G.1 Paint all interior and exterior surfaces of all ramps and trash enclosures. Paint exterior on the south and east sides of the South Ramp as needed. Includes surface preparation of power washing or an equivalent method prior painting. Excludes exterior of middle and north ramps. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $1,375,000.

G.2 Unify public parking with colors, signs, door colors, and elevator lobbies. Wall painting (images, words and / or color) unique to each parking ramp and parking level. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

G.3 Power washing on an annual basis. Annual cost. Includes stair wells and ramps. Basic power washing like done in 2013. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $30,000 annual cost.

G.4 Improve sanitation. Weekly cleaning of stairwells. City currently spending $26,000 per year. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $10,000 additional annual cost.

G.5 Entry and exit hospitality signs. Expansion of signs in 2013. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $25,000.

G.6 Screen all garbage areas, implement recycling centers three total enclosure walls - (2) at Middle Ramp, (1) at South Ramp - prefabricated ABS plastic or steel panel system with painted steel posts, gates, hardware - panels are patterned to look like louvers, brick or wood slats and can be custom color. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $60,000.

G.7 Add public art, murals, plants. Public art, murals and plants within the parking structure, in addition to "unifying" colors, signs, etc… above. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

G.8 Unify public parking aesthetic with exterior skins. Metal mesh or metal panel skin with supporting structure covering exposed elevations of South, Middle and North Ramps with painted steel panel with (8) 4'x6' display cases integral with skin on each ramp. Add $900,000 for stainless steel with (8) 65" LCD panels in outdoor cases on each ramp. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $600,000.

G.9 Information items / advertising. Make exterior pedestrian facing ground level of parking ramps feel like storefronts by adding display cases for businesses to advertise - this number also included in low and high values for skin improvements. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $75,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Ramp Painting Considerations

Painting of interior surfaces has been proposed as method for improving aesthetics of existing structures. Painting can improve light levels if light colors are used, which can improve contrast for security cameras. Colors and patterns can also be utilized for way finding and branding.

In order to repaint exterior surfaces at the South Ramp, surfaces would be cleaned and all loose material removed. Accomplishing this work while the ramp is occupied would require temporary enclosure of work areas or other methods of protecting adjacent surfaces and property from paint. This protection may temporarily impact stalls available within the ramp.

Garbage Screening Considerations

Existing waste collection areas within the district are located inside and outside the Middle Ramp and adjacent to the South Ramp. In many cases, dumpsters and other trash containers are exposed to view adjacent to major pedestrian circulation routes and business entries. It is a routine occurrence for some debris and an occasional oil spill to be on the ground in the waste area. This condition negatively affects perceptions of the district and also poses a liability as potential slip hazards. Renovation of existing screening as well as the addition of new screening and enclosures is proposed to create a consistent appearance throughout the district and improve waste management.

Enclosures created from modular, prefabricated wall, gate and post components made from low maintenance, durable materials are recommended at three locations. Screen

walls can be constructed from multiple types of plastic composite in a variety of patterns compatible with the district aesthetics. Within the ground level of the Middle Ramp, a three sided enclosure with multiple gates would be constructed on the existing floor slab. On the east side of the Middle Ramp, the existing southeast waste area would be expanded to screen the existing room and provide space for additional containers and recycling. On the northeast corner of the South Ramp, existing waste containers, compactors and utility boxes would be screened with an enclosure along the existing service drive. An additional enclosure location could be considered by business owners at the southeast corner of the South Ramp based on comments indicating a waste problem in that area.

These areas could be impacted by a pilot program of separating compostable materials from other waste. This program is anticipated to be implemented in 2014.

H. Streetscape

H.1 Replace dead / dying trees. 15 trees @ $500 and fix all tree grates. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $25,000.

H.2 Replace broken pavers. 30,000 SF (40% of total paver area) paver installation plus thru-drainage tubes and pea-rock in under slabs. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $500,000.

H.3 Add sidewalk to south side of 49 1/2 Street. 200 LF x 8 FT: 1600 SF of concrete pavers to match existing. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

H.4 Beautify entrance to South Ramp with landscaping pots or seating plaza. 500 SF integrally colored, textured concrete plaza with 3 benches and tables, trash receptacles, bicycle loops, screen walls and overstory trees, Order of magnitude cost estimate; $80,000.

H.5 Reconsider use of concrete pavers and replace with product with greater longevity and lower maintenance cost. Integrally colored, textured concrete as replacement for all pavers. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $1,500,000.

H.6 Add growing vegetation with colorful flower walls on South Ramp southern exposure. Approximately 6400 SF. of Green Screen mounted to face of ramp, ivy planting. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $250,000.

H.7 Add outdoor music in select plazas and "quiet" alleys. Cost estimate based on May 2009 estimate. Assumes directional boring cost share with irrigation work. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $120,000.

H.8 Convert loading alley between Spalon Montage and Middle Ramp to a decorative plaza that accommodates larger vehicles. Open paver plaza with landscaped edges and decorative lighting. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $300,000.

H.9 Create pedestrian plaza near West 51st Street entrance to South Ramp. 500 SF integrally colored, textured concrete plaza with three benches and tables, trash

receptacles, bicycle loops, screen walls and overstory trees. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $80,000.

H.10 Add small fountain with seating area near Clancy Lot. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $80,000.

H.11 Add planted median, where possible, along West 49th ½ Street. Assumes 12 foot wide raised median and 400 linear feet of street reconstruction, planter soil, trees and perennials. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $375,000.

H.12 Traffic calming at intersection of West 51st Street and Halifax Avenue. Assumes 100 linear feet of curb extensions on each side of West 51st Street at Halifax Avenue. No change to existing crosswalk sign and lights. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $100,000.

Note that alternatives H.13 and H.14 were added after the business owner and property owner survey was completed. Although alternatives H.13 and H.14 are at the end of the list of alternatives, it does not mean they are the lowest ranking alternatives.

H.13 Automatic irrigation system. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $175,000.

H.14 Repair planter beds. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $50,000.

Notes regarding the alternatives:

Previous Landscape Feasibility Report

The City of Edina initiated a 50th & France District Streetscape Improvements Feasibility Study. Through a process that involved the district's business and property owner group representatives and city staff members, a draft report was prepared and issued on April 11, 2012. This report identified issues, proposed improvements, costs and phasing for the district's streetscape and pedestrian facilities, with improvements to include; concrete paver repairs, street tree replacements, other landscape plantings, irrigation system, audio systems, and seasonal lighting. The April 11, 2012 50th & France District Streetscape Improvements Feasibility Study has been provided for reference in Appendix C.

This Parking and Wayfinding Improvements Feasibility Study includes many of the same elements included within the previous study. However, based on recent input from the business and property owner group representatives and city staff, some of the improvement elements and priorities established have been modified. Also, based on a combination of on-going replacement efforts and deterioration of some of these elements, the streetscape recommendations for replacements and repair have been updated in this study. It should be noted that one project has been initiated and completed as a part of the 2012 report. This included the replacement of trees and perennials, and the installation of an irrigation system within the raised planters along West 50th Street. This work was completed in 2012.

Existing Conditions

Many of the district's streetscape and pedestrian access improvements were either reconstructed or newly installed in 1990. These elements include street and pedestrian lighting, bollards and bollard lighting, specialty entrance monuments and wayfinding signage, raised planters, movable planters, a fountain, raised planters with trees and shrubs, at-grade foundation plantings of trees and shrubs, street trees planted in pits with tree grates, benches, trash receptacles, bicycle racks, newspaper corrals, concrete paver sidewalks, decorative handrails and fencing systems.

A majority of these improvements can generally be described as being in good condition. As addressed within this report, the following items fall under the category of needing repair or replacement:

1. Concrete Paver Sidewalks: Approximately one third of the total sidewalk area is in need of replacement as soon as possible for both safety and general appearance reasons. Pavers in these areas are in varying stages of failure, but in general present an unsafe surface for pedestrians. The failure is most likely attributed to an underlying drainage issue. The existing pavement section includes concrete pavers on 1" of leveling sand and a 6"+/- concrete under slab. There are no drains or means to remove water that accumulates on top of this concrete under slab. Therefore, deicing salt in combination with standing water has resulted in paver decomposition, from the bottom of the paver up. Over the past few years, city staff has either replaced pavers or patched the voids with asphalt at the removed pavers.

2. Street Trees: For the purposes of this report, street trees are identified as trees located within the street boulevard or within the pedestrian alleys, and planted in pits with tree grates. These trees are watered primarily by rainfall, but sometimes watered manually by city staff during drought conditions. The district does not have an automatic irrigation system for these trees or any other plantings within the public rights of way. There are approximately 80 street trees within the project. A majority of the trees are in reasonable condition, but approximately 15 to 20% require replacement due to damage from vehicles and vandalism, disease, sun scald, insects, lack of moisture and air, and a combination of all of these factors. Some street trees have reached the capacity of their tree grates ring openings, others have split trunks or large areas of bark removed, deformed, in general decline, or damaged in some way. Other trees are growing irregular and leaning towards buildings.

3. Other Landscaping: Other plantings exist within the district beyond street trees, and for this report are identified as those in raised planters or at-grade (building foundation) planting beds. The plants in these areas, like street trees, are only watered by rainfall and the occasional manual watering by city staff. Many of the trees in these planting areas are in reasonable condition. However, approximately a quarter require replacement because they have either outgrown their location and usefulness in their location, are leaning toward a building or pedestrian area, or have damage in some way. A majority of the ground plane plantings are shrubs, with some perennial plantings. While most are in reasonable condition, they have either outgrown their location or been damaged, in decline, and therefore need replacement. It is estimated that all shrubs and perennials will require replacement.

Audio System Considerations

To provide for a future audio system, wires could be included within the same directionally-bored conduits installed for the irrigation system. No speakers or electronic equipment would need to be installed with this project. This work is not included in the proposed improvements.

South Ramp Public Plaza Considerations

An approximate 500 SF public open space for district visitors and employees was contemplated within an existing open landscape area south of South Ramp. Possible plaza elements include concrete pavers on a permeable concrete under slab, benches, trash receptacle, screen wall, decorative planters and overstory trees. This work is not included in the proposed improvements.

I. Parking Ramp Repairs

I.1 Make necessary improvements to structural and functional elements of the parking ramps. Concrete repairs, joints, drain replacement, etc. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $650,000.

I.2 Make preventative maintenance repairs to prolong service life of parking ramps. Traffic membrane, deck sealer, etc. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $650,000.

I.3 Make necessary repairs to aesthetic elements of parking ramps. Order of magnitude cost estimate; $20,000.

6. ESTIMATED COST

The estimated costs for the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Project are detailed below. The estimated project costs include a 20 percent construction cost contingency and a 30 percent allowance for indirect costs such as engineering, administrative, and legal items as well as capitalized interest. Items in italics would be assessed under Chapter 429.

Proposed Capital Improvements		Estimated Cost
D.1	Increase Brightness of Lighting	$ 650,000
E.1	Parking Ramp Pedestrian Access	$ 100,000
E.3	New Elevator and Stair in South Ramp	$ 1,100,000
F.3	Dynamic Public Parking Wayfinding System	$ 350,000
G.1	*Paint All Ramp Interior and South Ramp Exterior Surfaces*	*$ 1,375,000*
G.6	*Screen All Garbage Areas*	*$ 60,000*
H.1	*Replace Dead / Dying Trees*	*$ 25,000*
H.2	*Replace Broken Pavers*	*$ 500,000*
H.13	Automatic Irrigation System	$ 175,000
H.14	*Repair Planter Beds*	*$ 50,000*
I.1	*Essential Ramp Repairs*	*$ 650,000*
I.2	*Preventative Ramp Maintenance*	*$ 650,000*
	Total Capital Cost	$ 5,685,000

Proposed Additional Annual Maintenance Improvements		Estimated Cost
B.3	*Holiday Season Parking Strategies*	*$ 35,000*
E.3	*New Elevator and Stair in South Ramp Maintenance*	*$ 10,000*
F.3	*Dynamic Public Parking Wayfinding System Maintenance*	*$ 10,000*
G.3	*Power Washing on Annual Basis*	*$ 30,000*
G.4	*Improve Sanitation*	*$ 10,000*
H.13	*Automatic Irrigation System Maintenance*	*$ 5,000*
I.2	Escrow for Future Periodic Preventative Maintenance	$ 100,000
Total Additional Annual Maintenance Cost		$ 200,000

7. METHOD OF FINANCING

The estimated costs for the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Project proposed to be financed through a combination of assessments, parking permit revenues, and other city funds. The following is a summary of the estimated funding amounts from each of the proposed financing sources:

Capital Cost Financing Source	Amount
Assessments	$ 3,310,000
Other City Funds	$ 2,375,000
Total	$ 5,685,000

Additional Annual Maintenance Cost Financing Source	Amount
Assessments	$ 100,000
Parking Permit Revenues	$ 100,000
Total	$ 200,000

Annual operations and maintenance costs have been in the range of $250,000 per year for the past few years. The Additional Annual Maintenance Cost of $200,000 is in addition to the historic average cost. Parking permit revenues are the best funding source for future periodic preventative maintenance, not annual operations and maintenance which are assessed, since periodic preventative maintenance can be a significant spike in the annual assessed maintenance costs.

Rebates for installing energy efficient light may be available from Xcel Energy to offset a portion of the cost of the lights. The amount of rebates offered by Xcel vary from time to time and would be determined at the time of design and construction.

The property owners' share of the capital and maintenance costs will be funded by assessments in accordance with Minnesota Statutes Chapter 429. A preliminary assessment roll is attached in Appendix E.

8. PROJECT SCHEDULE

If the City Council chooses to accept this report and proceed with the improvements, we recommend that the following project schedule be followed:

City Council Receive Feasibility Report, Call for Public Hearing, and Authorize Preparation of Final Plans and Specifications	January 21, 2014
Public Hearing, City Council Orders Project , Approves Plans and Specifications and Authorizes Ad for Bids	February 18, 2014
Bid Opening	May 22, 2014
Assessment Hearing / Award Contract	June 3, 2014
Edina Art Fair	*June 6-8, 2014*
Start 2014 Construction	June 16, 2014
Interim Construction Completion	October 2014
2014 Holiday Shopping Season	*Nov-Dec, 2014*
Start 2015 Construction	March 2015
Edina Art Fair	*June 2015*
Construction Complete	October 2015

The focus of construction in 2014 would be the dynamic wayfinding system, lighting upgrade, pedestrian access improvements, streetscape improvements, parking structure repairs and preventative maintenance. In order to mitigate impacts to businesses during construction, construction of the new stair and elevator core for the South Ramp and interior and exterior ramp painting is assumed to occur in 2015. The resulting project construction schedule will be longer than if all work is completed concurrently.

9. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based upon the analysis completed as a part of this feasibility report, the 50th & France Parking and Wayfinding Improvements are feasible, necessary, and cost effective. We recommend the following:

A. The Edina City Council accept this feasibility study and report on January 21, 2014.

B. After receiving the appropriate staff reports, the Council must decide whether to proceed with the project and on the final scope of the proposed improvements.

C. If a decision is made to proceed with the project, the Council must authorize the preparation of final plans and specifications for the improvements.